

DeKalb County Historic Preservation Commission

Tuesday, March 18, 2025- 6:00 P.M.

Staff Report

Regular Agenda

H. 1098 Oakdale Road, Robin Warren. Paint the brick and replace roof of a historic house.
1247459.

Built in 1928 (18 002 04 041)

This property is in the Druid Hills Character Area #1 and the Druid Hills National Register Historic District.

05-11 1098 Oakdale Road (DH), Eva Lyle. Install wooden privacy fence. 17068. **Partially approved, partially denied.**

Summary

The applicant proposes replacing the current orange clay barrel tile roof with asphalt architectural shingles. Furthermore, the applicant proposes painting the currently unpainted and untreated exterior brick of the historic house. The paint will be a Luxon XP masonry coating from Sherwin-Williams. The brick will be repointed prior to painting.

Recommendation

Deny. Paint and other surface treatments should not be applied to historic masonry in accordance with guidelines 6.1.1, 6.1.2, and 6.8. Painting the masonry does not address the underlying issue of the failing mortar, which should be maintained and repaired as needed in accordance with guidelines 6.1.1 and 6.7.

U.S. Department of the Interior, Heritage Preservation Services Preservation Brief #1, "Assessing Cleaning and Water-Repellant Treatments for Historic Masonry Buildings."

<https://www.nps.gov/orgs/1739/upload/preservation-brief-01-cleaning-masonry.pdf>

"Generally, however, waterproof coatings, which include elastomeric paints, should almost never be applied above grade to historic masonry buildings." (pg. 15)

"An elastomeric coating holds moisture in the masonry because it does not "breathe" and does not allow liquid moisture to escape. If the water pressure builds up sufficiently it can cause the coating to break and pop off as shown in this example, often pulling pieces of the masonry with it." (pg. 15)

U.S. Department of the Interior, Heritage Preservation Services Preservation Brief #38, "Removing Graffiti from Historic Masonry." <https://www.nps.gov/orgs/1739/upload/preservation-brief-38-graffiti.pdf>

"Like transparent coatings, pigmented coatings may be difficult or impossible to remove completely once their performance or appearance is no longer satisfactory." (pg. 9)

Historic roofing materials should be repaired if possible and only replaced in-kind with like materials if repair is not possible in accordance with guidelines 6.1.1, 6.1.2, and 6.1.5. The proposed

architectural asphalt shingles do not match the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic clay tile roofing and are therefore not an acceptable new material.

Relevant Guidelines

- 5.0 *Design Review Objective* (p45) - When making a material change to a structure that is in view from a public right-of-way, a higher standard is required to ensure that design changes are compatible with the architectural style of the structure and retain character-defining features. When a proposed material change to a structure is not in view from the public-right-way, the Preservation Commission may review the project with a less strict standard so as to allow the owner more flexibility. Such changes, however, shall not have a substantial adverse effect on the overall architectural character of the structure.
- 6.1.1 *Exterior Materials* (p50) Guideline - Original masonry should be retained to the greatest extent possible without the application of any surface treatment, including paint. Repointing of mortar joints should only be undertaken when necessary, and the new mortar should duplicate the original material in composition, color, texture, method of application, and joint profile. Repaired joints should not exceed the width of original joints. The use of electric saws and hammers in the removal of old mortar is strongly discouraged as these methods can seriously damage adjacent bricks.
- 6.1.2 *Architectural Details* (p52) Guideline - Stylistic details should be maintained and treated with sensitivity. The removal of such details or application of details inappropriate to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. Damaged elements should be repaired rather than replaced if at all possible. Historic details that have been lost or are beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical documentation and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture.
- 6.1.5 *Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers* (p56) Guideline - Historic roofing materials, such as clay tile and slate, should be repaired rather than replaced, if at all possible. While repair or replacement with like materials is often considered to be cost prohibitive, it should be remembered that life expectancies of these roofs (slate, 60 to 125 years and longer; clay tile, 100+ years) is considerably greater than most replacement materials. Clay tile and slate roofs are always character-defining features of their buildings; therefore, if replacement is necessary, new materials should match as closely as possible the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic roofing material.
- 6.8 *Exterior Colors* (p60) Guideline - The initial painting or other surface treatment of masonry and stucco will be reviewed by the preservation commission, and shall not be precluded if brought in a retroactive application. The specific color of the paint, however, will not be reviewed. Appropriate paint colors are usually related to the style and type of the property in question. (Approved 6-18-2018)



DeKalb County
GEORGIA

Development Services Center
178 Sams Street
Decatur, GA 30030
www.dekalbcountyga.gov/planning
404-371-2155 (o); 404-371-4556 (f)

Chief Executive Officer
Michael Thurmond

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY

Interim Director
Cedric Hudson

Application for Certificate of Appropriateness

Date submitted: 02/06/2025 Date Received: _____

Address of Subject Property: 1098 Oakdale Rd NE Atlanta, Ga 30307

Applicant: Robin Warren E-Mail: febwarren@gmail.com

Applicant Mailing Address: 754 Lullwater Rd NE, Atlanta GA 30307

Applicant Phone: 404-454-0857

Applicant's relationship to the owner: Owner Architect Contractor/Builder Other

Owner(s): Victor and Robin Warren Email: febwarren@gmail.com

Owner(s): Victor Warren Properties, Inc Email: febwarren@gmail.com

Owner(s) Mailing Address: 754 Lullwater Rd NE, Atlanta, GA 30307

Owner(s) Telephone Number: 404-454-0857

Approximate date of construction of the primary structure on the property and any other structures affected by this project: March 19

Nature of work (check all that apply):

- | | | | | | |
|-------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-----------------------------|-------------------------------------|
| New construction | <input type="checkbox"/> | New Accessory Building | <input type="checkbox"/> | Other Building Changes | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Demolition | <input type="checkbox"/> | Landscaping | <input type="checkbox"/> | Other Environmental Changes | <input type="checkbox"/> |
| Addition | <input type="checkbox"/> | Fence/Wall | <input type="checkbox"/> | Other | <input checked="" type="checkbox"/> |
| Moving a Building | <input type="checkbox"/> | Sign Installation | <input type="checkbox"/> | | |

Description of Work:

replace roof
Paint Brick agreeable gray

This form must be completed in its entirety and be accompanied by supporting documents, such as plans, list of materials, color samples, photographs, etc. All documents should be in PDF format, except for photographs, which may be in JPEG format. Email the application and supporting material to plansustain@dekalbcountyga.gov and pvjennings@dekalbcountyga.gov. An incomplete application will not be accepted.

Signature of Applicant: Robin Warren
404-454-0857

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING & SUSTAINABILITY

Authorization of a Second Party to Apply for a Certificate of Appropriateness

This form is required if the individual making the request is **not** the owner of the property.

I/ We: n/a _____

being owner(s) of the property at: _____

hereby delegate authority to: _____

to file an application for a certificate of appropriateness in my/our behalf.

Signature of Owner(s): _____

Date: _____

Please review the following information

Approval of this Certificate of Appropriateness does not release the recipient from compliance with all other pertinent county, state, and federal regulations.

Before making any changes to your approved plans, contact the preservation planner (404/371- 2155). Some changes may fall within the scope of the existing approval, but others will require review by the preservation commission. If work is performed which is not in accordance with your certificate, a Stop Work Order may be issued.

If your project requires that the county issue a Certificate of Occupancy at the end of construction, an inspection may be made to verify that the work has been completed in accord with the Certificate of Appropriateness. If the work as completed is not the same as that approved in the Certificate of Appropriateness you will not receive a Certificate of Occupancy. You may also be subject to other penalties including fines and/or required demolition of the non-conforming work.

If you do not commence construction within twelve months of the date of approval, your Certificate of Appropriateness will become void and you will need to apply for a new certificate if you still intend to do the work.





























1459



Best Seller

GAF

Timberline HDZ Charcoal Algae Resistant Laminated High Definition Shingles (33.33 sq. ft. per Bundle)

★★★★★ (9254) ✓ Questions & Answers (125)

OPTION 'A' charcoal

1098 Oakdale RdNE
Atlanta, 30307



Hover Image to Zoom

①

GAF

Timberline HDZ Hickory Algae Resistant Laminated High Definition Shingles (33.33 sq. ft. per Bundle)

★★★★★ (9032) Questions & Answers (10)

*Option "B" Hickory
1098 Oakdale Rd NE*

*Atlanta
30307*



Hover Image to Zoom

GAF

Timberline HDZ Hickory Algae Resistant Laminated High Definition Shingles (33.33 sq. ft. per Bundle)

★★★★★ (9032) Questions & Answers (10)

*Option B
example*

*1098 Oakdale Rd NE
Atlanta 30307*



Hover Image to Zoom