

DeKalb County Historic Preservation Commission

Monday, July 15th, 2024- 6:00 P.M.

Staff Report

Special Agenda

I. 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. **1246710.**

House built 1922-1925. (18 055 02 020)

The house and its immediate surroundings are listed on the National Register of Historic Places. The property is not in a National Register historic district or an identified character area.

- 11-99 1256-1260 Briarcliff Road--Emory West Campus (DH), Talka & Connor /Architects & Engineers. Temporary installation of seven modular buildings. **Approved**
- 12-01 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Emory University. Replace signs within the complex. **Approved**
- 9-05 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Powertel/Atlanta, Inc.—Sarran Marshall. Install cellular antenna panels and cable on rooftop of nonhistoric building. **Approved**
- 10-05 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Verizon Wireless/Brandon Stewart. Install cellular antenna panels and cable on rooftop of nonhistoric building. **Approved**
- 3-11 1256/1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Charles Rossignol (Emory University). Demolish eight cottages on Emory West campus. 16959 **Approved**
- 3-12 1256 Briarcliff Road (DH), Sprint Corporation (c/o Pat Dominick). Modifications to cell antenna location. 17727 **Approved**
- 2-14 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Emory University – James Johnson. Construct new building. **For comment only**
- 3-14 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Emory University. Erect new building. 19185 **Approved**
- 2-15 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), James Johnson, Emory University. Demolish small, nonhistoric former residence. 19727 **Approved with modification**
- 6-15 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), James Johnson. Demolish five nonhistoric cottages. 19960 **Approved with modifications**
- 6-15 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), James Johnson. Remodel the entry to the property. 19967 **Approved with modifications**
- 11-16 1260 Briarcliff Road (DH), Republic Property Company, Inc. Restore the Briarcliff Mansion while building additional structures and modifying the landscape. 21119 **Approved with modification**
- 7-22 1260 Briarcliff Road, Tim Gary, CEO – Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the historic house and grounds and develop the non-historic part of the property. **Approved**
- 11-23 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Approve with Modification – Partially Deferred.**
- 12-23 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Deferred.**
- 01-24 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Deferred.**
- 02-24 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Partially Approved, Partially Deferred.**
- 03-24 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Deferred.**
- 04-24 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Deferred.**
- 05-24 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Deferred.**
- 06-24 1256 Briarcliff Road, Karen Gravel for Galerie Living. Rehabilitate the Candler Mansion and carriage house. 1246710. **Deferred.**

Summary

February 2024

Applicant submitted a new site plan for proposed landscaping and site improvements around the Candler Mansion. These improvements include:

- Install on-grade landings and walkways from portico steps to front driveway
- Construct a circling roadway around the historic pool and building foundations located on the front lawn of the historic mansion
- Install roundabout in front of historic mansion
- Remove large tree located behind Carriage House
- Grade down area to the Northwest of the historic mansion, sloping driveway down into proposed new parking lot
- Construct a small pond in the area between the summer pavilion and the historic green houses
- Plant trees around the proposed sidewalk and roadway

The new site plan will retain the historic pool, the building foundation of the historic changing-rooms for the pool, the driveway that leads to and through the historic summer pavilion, and the walkway leading from the summer pavilion to the historic green houses.

November 2023

Applicant proposes various work to rehabilitate the Candler Mansion. This includes restoring exterior elements including historic roof, constructing a rear addition, and constructing new exterior ramps, stairways, and entries.

- Roofing, Gutters, and Downspouts
 - Remove and replace sloped roofing
 - Replace with sloped roof constructed of green barrel tile to resemble the original roof type of the house and optionally as architectural grade asphalt shingles
 - Remove and replace low slope roofing
 - Replace flat roof area with single ply membrane roof materials
- Construct a Rear Addition in the West Elevation Rear Courtyard
 - Construct an addition on the rear exterior of the property, creating a walk-way connecting the Solarium to the Kitchen area and Stair Hall.
 - Addition will house a three-stop elevator.
 - Addition will be constructed of metal with a curtain wall of windows, with stone on the lower metal and brick on the side walls.
 - Addition will have a stone ballast roof.
 - An expansion joint will be used to connect the addition to the building.
 - Modify existing window opening leading into Solarium to serve as entry door into main building from addition.
- Installation of Exterior Stairs, Ramps, and Guardrails
 - Ramps
 - Install concrete ramp along exterior of the South Elevation, leading to the pavilion and Porte cochere.

- Install 7-inch-thick concrete topping slab on existing walkway to match solarium floor level, leading to ramp
 - Install new 42-inch steel guardrails with handrails along ramp
 - Install curved concrete ramp along the right side of the front exterior, leading to the main entry porch.
 - Walkway on built up grade, leading to start of new ramp
 - Install new 42-inch steel guardrails with handrails along ramp
- Guardrails
 - Install code complaint steel guardrail and handrail on existing landing and steps located on North Elevation, leading to the Music Hall
- Site Improvements of Historic Property
 - Install on-grade landings and walkways from portico steps to front driveway
 - Construct a pavilion on top of the existing building foundation located in front of the historic mansion, to the left of the main driveway
 - Construct a circling roadway around the proposed pavilion and garden located on the front lawn of the historic mansion
 - Install garden in existing area surrounding the current water feature located in front of the historic mansion, to the left of the main driveway
 - Plant three trees in front of historic mansion in center of proposed roundabout
 - Install roundabout in front of historic mansion
 - Removal of road leading up and through summer pavilion
 - Remove large tree located behind Carriage House
 - Grade down area to the Northwest of the historic mansion, sloping driveway down into proposed new parking lot

Recommendation

Defer. The applicant has requested deferral to the August 2024 meeting.

Relevant Guidelines

5.0 *Design Review Objective* (p45) - When making a material change to a structure that is in view from a public right-of-way, a higher standard is required to ensure that design changes are compatible with the architectural style of the structure and retain character-defining features. When a proposed material change to a structure is not in view from the public-right-way, the Preservation Commission may review the project with a less strict standard so as to allow the owner more flexibility. Such changes, however, shall not have a substantial adverse effect on the overall architectural character of the structure.

6.1.1 *Exterior Materials* (p51) Guideline - The application of artificial or nonhistoric exterior siding materials such as brick veneers; asphalt shingle siding; and cementitious, aluminum, or vinyl siding is discouraged. These materials are not successful in mimicking details of original wood siding (the most common material over which they are applied); subsequently, their use greatly compromises the historic integrity of buildings. Application often results in the loss or distortion of architectural details, and improper installation can result in damage of historic materials.

Use of compatible and high quality “look-a-like” synthetic building materials may be allowable, especially in order to reduce costs, provided (1) the substitute material can be installed without irreversibly damaging or obscuring the historic material and architectural features and trim of the building and (2) the substitute material can match the historic material in size, profile, and finish so that there is no change in the historic character of the building.

- 6.1.2 *Architectural Details* (p52) Guideline - Stylistic details should be maintained and treated with sensitivity. The removal of such details or application of details inappropriate to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. Damaged elements should be repaired rather than replaced if at all possible. Historic details that have been lost or are beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical documentation and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture.
- 6.1.3 *Entrances and Porches* (p53) Guideline - Original porches and steps should be retained. Repair of porches should not result in the removal of original materials (such as balusters, columns, hand rails, brackets, and roof detailing) unless they are seriously deteriorated. If replacement materials must be introduced, the new should match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features should be substantiated, if possible, by documentary and physical evidence.
- 6.1.5 *Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers* (p56) Guideline - The original roof form should be retained to the greatest extent possible. No addition to a house should greatly alter the original form of a roof or render that form unrecognizable. Original or historic roof dormers should also be retained. Skylights should be installed so as to be as unobtrusive as possible. If additional upper-story space is required, consider using dormers placed out-of-view of public right-of-way—to create this space.
- 6.1.5 *Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers* (p56) Guideline - Historic roofing materials, such as clay tile and slate, should be repaired rather than replaced, if at all possible. While repair or replacement with like materials is often considered to be cost prohibitive, it should be remembered that life expectancies of these roofs (slate, 60 to 125 years and longer; clay tile, 100+ years) is considerably greater than most replacement materials. Clay tile and slate roofs are always character-defining features of their buildings; therefore, if replacement is necessary, new materials should match as closely as possible the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic roofing material.
6. *Gutters* (p58) Guideline - Gutters and downspouts should be maintained in their original appearance and location if functioning properly.
7. *Gutters* (p58) Guideline - New downspouts should be along the edges and corners of buildings and along porch supports so as to create minimal visual disruption. In locating new downspouts, consideration should be given to water flow with regard to avoiding seepage into basements and impacts to foundation plantings.
- 6.5 *Health and Safety Code Compliance* (p59) Guideline - Compliance with health and safety codes and handicapped access requirements should be carried out with a minimum of impact to the historic character of community institutional buildings. Adding handicapped ramps is a common issue. Placement of new ramps should be done so as to minimize visual impact to the building, particularly the principal elevation (front) of the building.
- 6.5 *Health and Safety Code Compliance* (p59) Recommendation - Necessary access ramps on the front facade should be constructed in such a way that they can be removed without damage to the facade.
- 6.8 *Exterior Colors* (p60) Recommendation - Homeowners considering painting their homes are encouraged to determine the range of paint colors and techniques applicable to the particular architectural period of their property so that a proper choice might be made. The placement of different colors on a house (i.e., the primary color as well as trim colors) is also of critical importance.
- 7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Guideline - Additions should not be added to the main facade of the building and should not appear to dominate the original structure. It is preferable to build new additions to the rear of a historic building, where it will have little or no impact on the streetscape facade. Design and materials should be compatible with the existing building. Avoid obscuring character-defining features of the historic building with the addition.
- 7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - The Secretary of the Interior's Standards recommend that an addition be designed so that at a later date it can be removed without compromising the historic character of the building.

- 7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - While an addition should be compatible, it is acceptable and appropriate for it to be clearly discernible as an addition rather than appearing to be an original part of the building. Consider providing some differentiation in material, color, and/or detailing and setting additions back from the historic building's wall plane.
- 7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - These guidelines do not recommend adding false historical details to a noncontributing building in an effort to make it more compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Every effort should be made, however, to ensure that additions and alterations to the property do not detract further from the character of the historic environment, keeping in mind the design concepts discussed in Section 7.2.
- 10.0 *Archaeological Resources* (p93) Guideline - When planning new construction, additions, site improvements, or demolition, minimize disturbance of terrain to reduce the possibility of destroying unknown archaeological materials.
- 10.0 *Archaeological Resources* (p93) Recommendation - Check with the county in the planning stages to see if the subject property is an area of low or high archaeological site potential or an area of recorded historic occupation.
- 10.0 *Archaeological Resources* (p93) Recommendation - Hire qualified professionals to survey areas where major terrain alteration is planned to identify potential archaeological resources. Preserve in place known archaeological material whenever possible. If preservation in place is not possible, document resources before proceeding with a project.