

# DeKalb County Historic Preservation Commission

Monday, July 15<sup>th</sup>, 2024- 6:00 P.M.

## Staff Report

### Regular Agenda

F. 1156 Springdale Road, Karen Soorikian. Construct rear and side additions, replace windows, and install landscaping. **1247120.**

Built in 1910 (18 002 01 016)

This property is located in Druid Hills Character Area #1 and is in the Druid Hill National Register Historic District.

- 10-03 1156 Springdale Road (DH), Robert Linkins & Janet McNicholl. Widen and realign driveway; widen front walkway; make changes to driveway, turnaround and walkways in back yard; and build patio behind the house. **Approved with modifications.**
- 04-06 1156 Springdale Road (DH), Janet McNicholl. Add second floor to rear wing. 1795. **Approved**
- 07-07 1156 Springdale Road (DH), Janet McNicholl. Renew previously approved rear addition with minor modifications. 13742. **Approved as modified.**
- 04-09 1156 Springdale Road (DH), Cynthia Tauxe. Replace driveway gate, add two gas lamps, build brick mailbox, and build patio behind the house. 15745. **Approved as modified.**
- 04-21 1156 Springdale Road (DH). Scott Young. Demolition of existing garage, drive, walks, steps, gravel areas. Rear addition to the house, new garage, installation of pool, pool house, fencing. New driveway and walls. 1244756. **Deferred.**
- 05-21 1156 Springdale Road, Scott Young. Demolition of existing garage, drive, walks, steps, gravel areas. Rear addition to the house, new garage, installation of pool, pool house, fencing. New driveway and walls. 1244756. **Deferred.**
- 06-21 1156 Springdale Road (DH). Scott Young. Demolition of existing garage, drive, walks, steps, gravel areas. Rear addition to the house, new garage, installation of pool, pool house, fencing. New driveway and walls. 1244756. **Part approved; part deferred**
- 07-21 1156 Springdale Road (DH). Scott Young. Build an addition on the rear and right side and build a garage and pavilion. 1244756. **Part approved; part denied.**
- 10-21 1156 Springdale Road, Scott Young. Build an addition on the rear and right side and build a garage and pavilion. 1244756. **Remanded Denied**

### Summary

The applicant proposes the following work:

1. Construct a two-story rear addition. The rear addition will be constructed with a brick façade, wood casement windows with divided lites, two wood round casement windows, a clay-tile hipped roof, a set of three recessed arched painted wood French doors, and limestone or cast stone surrounding the arched French doors. The existing nonhistoric set of French doors on the rear of the property will be removed and replaced with an arched open-covered entry.
2. Construct a one-story on the right side of the house. The side addition will be set back from the front façade of the home by 31' 7½", and will be constructed with a brick façade, wood casement windows with divided lites, a clay-tile hipped roof, and a side-brick chimney.
3. Replace non-historic windows and doors. The following nonhistoric windows and doors will be replaced:

- The non-historic set of windows in the arch on the front façade of the original open porch will be removed and replaced with new set of metal and glass windows with divided lites.
  - The non-historic set of windows in the arches in the arches on the side-façade of the original open porch will be removed and replaced with a set of metal and glass windows with divided lites.
  - The non-historic set of windows in the arch on the rear façade of the original open porch will be removed and replaced with a set of metal and glass doors with divided lites to match the arches on the front and side façade.
  - The non-historic set of French doors on the front façade of the right side of the house, leading to the original sunroom, will be removed and replaced with a new set of metal and glass doors.
4. Install a skylight. A skylight will be installed on the roof above the center stair hall.
  5. Install new landscaping and hardscape. The landscaping and hardscape will include:
    - A low wall enclosure for a garden on the left side of the home, at the base of the original open porch.
    - Remove trees in the side and backyards to make space for new additions and the later installation of a pool and pavilion. Trees in the front yard will not be disturbed.
    - The remaining landscaping and grading will take place in the second phase of the project.

### **Recommendation**

Approve. These proposed changes do not appear to have a substantial adverse effect on the district. This application appears to meet the guidelines and the staff recommends approval.

### **Relevant Guidelines**

- 5.0 *Design Review Objective* (p45) - When making a material change to a structure that is in view from a public right-of-way, a higher standard is required to ensure that design changes are compatible with the architectural style of the structure and retain character-defining features. When a proposed material change to a structure is not in view from the public-right-way, the Preservation Commission may review the project with a less strict standard so as to allow the owner more flexibility. Such changes, however, shall not have a substantial adverse effect on the overall architectural character of the structure.
- 6.1.2 *Architectural Details* (p52) Guideline - Stylistic details should be maintained and treated with sensitivity. The removal of such details or application of details inappropriate to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. Damaged elements should be repaired rather than replaced if at all possible. Historic details that have been lost or are beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical documentation and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture.
- 6.1.3 *Entrances and Porches* (p53) Guideline - Original porches and steps should be retained. Repair of porches should not result in the removal of original materials (such as balusters, columns, hand rails, brackets, and roof detailing) unless they are seriously deteriorated. If replacement materials must be introduced, the new should match the old in design, color, texture, and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features should be substantiated, if possible, by documentary and physical evidence.
- 6.1.3 *Entrances and Porches* (p53) Guideline - The enclosure of front porches and side porches visible from a right-of-way should utilize transparent materials, such as screen or glass, which will help maintain the original open character of the design.
- 6.1.4 *Windows* (p55) Guideline - Existing windows, including sashes, lights, lintels, sills, frames, molding, shutters, and all hardware should be retained and repaired through routine maintenance whenever possible. When deteriorated elements must be replaced, new elements should be compatible with the original in terms of material, design and

hardware. Should it be necessary to replace an entire window, the replacement should be sized to the original opening and should duplicate all proportions and configurations of the original window.

6.1.5 *Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers* (p56) Guideline - The original roof form should be retained to the greatest extent possible. No addition to a house should greatly alter the original form of a roof or render that form unrecognizable. Original or historic roof dormers should also be retained. Skylights should be installed so as to be as unobtrusive as possible. If additional upper-story space is required, consider using dormers placed out-of-view of public right-of-way—to create this space.

6.1.5 *Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers* (p56) Guideline - Historic roofing materials, such as clay tile and slate, should be repaired rather than replaced, if at all possible. While repair or replacement with like materials is often considered to be cost prohibitive, it should be remembered that life expectancies of these roofs (slate, 60 to 125 years and longer; clay tile, 100+ years) is considerably greater than most replacement materials. Clay tile and slate roofs are always character-defining features of their buildings; therefore, if replacement is necessary, new materials should match as closely as possible the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic roofing material.

7.0 Additions & New Construction - Preserving Form & Layout The Druid Hills Local Historic District continues to change and evolve over time. For this area to meet contemporary needs, additions are built, uses change, and new buildings are constructed. The challenge is not to prevent change but to ensure that, when it does inevitably happen, it is compatible with the historic character of the area.

A new building is compatible with its historic setting when it borrows design characteristics and materials from adjacent buildings and integrates them into a modern expression. Before undertaking new development, be it a new building or changes or additions to existing buildings, take time to evaluate what makes the property and the neighborhood distinctive. Evaluate what type of impact the new development will have on the property and neighborhood. Decide how the development can best be designed to complement the property and area.

The underlying guideline for new construction and additions is to consider one's neighbors and nearby structures and reinforce the existing historic character through sensitive, compatible design.

Note that many of these guidelines refer to new development or new construction but are equally applicable to additions to existing buildings.

7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Guideline - Additions should not be added to the main facade of the building and should not appear to dominate the original structure. It is preferable to build new additions to the rear of a historic building, where it will have little or no impact on the streetscape facade. Design and materials should be compatible with the existing building. Avoid obscuring character-defining features of the historic building with the addition.

7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Guideline - Additional stories should be set well back from the roof edge to ensure that the historic building's proportions and profile are not radically changed.

7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - The Secretary of the Interior's Standards recommend that an addition be designed so that at a later date it can be removed without compromising the historic character of the building.

7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - While an addition should be compatible, it is acceptable and appropriate for it to be clearly discernible as an addition rather than appearing to be an original part of the building. Consider providing some differentiation in material, color, and/or detailing and setting additions back from the historic building's wall plane.

7.3.1 *Additions* (p74) Recommendation - These guidelines do not recommend adding false historical details to a noncontributing building in an effort to make it more compatible with surrounding historic buildings. Every effort should be made, however, to ensure that additions and alterations to the property do not detract further from the character of the historic environment, keeping in mind the design concepts discussed in Section 7.2.

8.2 *Trees* (p78) Recommendation - The mature hardwood forest within the Druid Hills Local Historic District should be perpetuated through a district-wide replanting program. Trees should be replaced when mature trees are lost to age or damage or are removed for safety reasons. Replacement trees should be of identical or similar varieties to the

original trees. A diversity of tree types is recommended to perpetuate the existing character of most tree groupings. Replacement trees of adequate size (1.5" caliper minimum) are recommended. Existing ordinances that provide for the protection and replacement of the district's tree resources should be applied to development activities within Druid Hills.

- 9.4 *Enclosures and Walls* (p90) Guideline - Fences and walls should not be built in front yard spaces and are strongly discouraged from corner lot side yard spaces. Retaining walls should only be used in situations where topography requires their use.