

DeKalb County Historic Preservation Commission

Monday, June 17th, 2024- 6:00 P.M.

Staff Report

Regular Agenda

I. 1041 Oakdale Road, Margret Wyatt. Replace slate roof. **1247071.**

Built in 1920 (18 002 06 034)

This property is located in Druid Hills Character #1 and in the Druid Hill National Register Historic District.

- 08-05 1041 Oakdale Road (DH), Drew & Margaret Wyatt. Rear addition, enclose screened porch, add bay off master bath. **Approved.**
- 12-05 1041 Oakdale Road (DH), Drew Wyatt. Install swimming pool, patio, pergola, and fence in backyard; relocate garage stairs; replace wooden fence with metal; and install section of fence along the driveway. **Approved.**
- 02-14 1041 Oakdale Road (DH), Margaret Wyatt. Relocate carriage house steps and add a pergola. 19111. **Approved.**

Summary

The applicant proposes replacing the existing slate roof on the front and side elevations of the house with Grand Manor architectural shingles that match the existing shingles on the rear of the roof. The applicant has stated that they may consider using Envioslate as an option rather than architectural shingles.

Recommendation

Approve with Modifications. Slate should be taken from areas of the roof with less damage and reused to repair the areas that have been damaged.

Relevant Guidelines

5.0 *Design Review Objective* (p45) - When making a material change to a structure that is in view from a public right-of-way, a higher standard is required to ensure that design changes are compatible with the architectural style of the structure and retain character-defining features. When a proposed material change to a structure is not in view from the public-right-way, the Preservation Commission may review the project with a less strict standard so as to allow the owner more flexibility. Such changes, however, shall not have a substantial adverse effect on the overall architectural character of the structure.

6.1.1 *Exterior Materials* (p51) Guideline - The application of artificial or nonhistoric exterior siding materials such as brick veneers; asphalt shingle siding; and cementitious, aluminum, or vinyl siding is discouraged. These materials are not successful in mimicking details of original wood siding (the most common material over which they are applied); subsequently, their use greatly compromises the historic integrity of buildings. Application often results in the loss or distortion of architectural details, and improper installation can result in damage of historic materials.

Use of compatible and high quality "look-a-like" synthetic building materials may be allowable, especially in order to reduce costs, provided (1) the substitute material can be installed without irreversibly damaging or obscuring the historic material and architectural features and trim of the building and (2) the substitute material can match the historic material in size, profile, and finish so that there is no change in the historic character of the building.

6.1.2 *Architectural Details* (p52) Guideline - Stylistic details should be maintained and treated with sensitivity. The removal of such details or application of details inappropriate to the period or style of a house is strongly discouraged. Damaged elements should be repaired rather than replaced if at all possible. Historic details that have been lost or are

beyond repair may be replaced with new materials, provided that their earlier presence can be substantiated by historical documentation and that the new materials match the original in composition, design, color, and texture.

6.1.5 *Roofs, Chimneys, and Dormers* (p56) Guideline - Historic roofing materials, such as clay tile and slate, should be repaired rather than replaced, if at all possible. While repair or replacement with like materials is often considered to be cost prohibitive, it should be remembered that life expectancies of these roofs (slate, 60 to 125 years and longer; clay tile, 100+ years) is considerably greater than most replacement materials. Clay tile and slate roofs are always character-defining features of their buildings; therefore, if replacement is necessary, new materials should match as closely as possible the scale, texture, and coloration of the historic roofing material.